

**History 901:  
Citizenship, Belonging, and the Nineteenth-Century United States**

Thursdays, 8:50-10:45  
Humanities 5245

Steve Kantrowitz  
[skantrow@wisc.edu](mailto:skantrow@wisc.edu)  
263-1844  
Humanities 5119  
Office hours: Tuesday, 10-12

What was citizenship in 19<sup>th</sup>-century America? Who could claim it? Where were the borders between inclusion and exclusion, and between the citizen and its ideological antitheses—savage, slave, dependent, and alien? What other forms of incorporation and belonging mattered in people's lives? How did these histories interact as borders crossed people and people crossed borders? How, when, and why did the answers to those questions change?

These questions provide a lens onto some of the period's central topics (slavery and emancipation, settler colonialism and Native resistance/survivance, immigration and exclusion, the boundaries of Liberal citizenship) and essential themes (belonging, incorporation, identity, conflict, capitalism, white supremacy, and more). This course seeks to connect and deepen the conversations about these subjects across the subfields of legal, political, immigration, African American, Native American, Asian-American, and women's and gender history.

We are a scholarly community. You are not in competition with one another, and you should strive to help each other develop ideas. At the same time, respectful disagreement—with the texts, with me, with each other—is crucial to intellectual life. It is not always easy to balance these sometimes-competing imperatives, but we must try. And trying in turn requires that you participate regularly and bravely, while making sure not to dominate discussion.

Being a Ph.D. student is hard work. At various points you will have questions that you may hesitate to articulate in front of your peers; I know the saying is that there are no stupid questions, but it doesn't always feel that way. Please submit these sorts of questions to me via email so that I can respond to them privately or, if appropriate, for the whole seminar (anonymously, of course). It's quite likely that more than one of your classmates has the same question.

**Format and Workload**

This is a discussion-based seminar. I will periodically offer a brief historical or historiographical overview, but for the most part the burden is on you to be prepared with questions, observations, and connections. The course requirements reflect that balance of responsibility.

The credit standard for this 3-credit course is met by an expectation of a total of 135 hours of student engagement with the course's learning activities (at least 45 hours per credit or 9 hours per week), which include regularly scheduled meeting times (group seminar meetings of 115 minutes per week), dedicated online time, reading, writing, individual consultations with the instructor, and other student work as described in the syllabus.

**Grading**

Participation in seminar discussion: 35%

Discussion leadership, including submitted roadmap for discussion: 2 x 10% = 20%

Review assignment: 15%

Final essay: 30%

**Materials**

Please make sure you have hardcopies or **offline** access to the week's readings during seminar. We will be offline.

## Assignments

### 1. Discussion Questions and Leadership

Each week beginning on Feb. 6, one or more students will be responsible for setting an agenda and guiding discussion based upon it. That agenda should include:

- Essential facts about the reading:
  - Who is the author, what prepared them to write this book, and what relevant work followed from it?
  - What kind of book is this? (i.e., revised dissertation, subsequent book, trade/crossover, etc.)
- Questions essential to understanding academic history generally:
  - What is the book's overarching argument?
  - How does the work's structure advance that argument?
  - What field(s) does it seek to intervene in, and in what specific way(s)?
  - What are its sources, and what method and/or theory guides its reading of those sources?
  - What do we need to know about the work's reception? (reviews, prizes, controversy, etc.)
  - How does the companion article complement, challenge, or complicate our understanding of the book?
- Questions particular to this seminar:
  - How does the book explicitly and/or implicitly intervene in the historiography of citizenship?
  - What other interpretive light does it shed on the broader question of how people belong to nations or other forms of political community?

Note that these are starting points and guidelines: each week's agenda should revolve around the specific issues and problems raised by that week's readings. Discussion leaders should strive to craft questions that get to the heart of (among other things) the problems and possibilities of work in that field, how the book mobilizes specific kinds of evidence and analysis in support of its argument, and the strengths and (finally) weaknesses of the book on its own terms and in relation to related work. (I will provide examples of discussion questions during our discussion of Walter Johnson's *Soul By Soul* on Jan. 30.)

In creating this roadmap for discussion, leaders will be aided by their classmates: **each week beginning Jan. 30, no later than Wednesday at 9 a.m., every member of the seminar will post two discussion questions to Canvas.** Discussion leaders should adapt, combine, group, and in other ways curate these questions into their own discussion agenda, which should then be submitted to me via Canvas no later than Wednesday at 8 p.m.

**2. Book Review and Historiographical Context:** Each student will write a two-part assignment based on one week of the syllabus between Feb. 6 and March 26.

A: A 750-word review of the assigned book. The first paragraph of that review must include a 50-word statement of the book's argument; the rest of the review should follow the model of reviews in *The Journal of American History*.

B: A ca. 1500-word analysis of that work's relationship to some aspect or aspects of the historiography of citizenship. In some cases the work's author will make this explicit in the text; in other cases you will have to dig into the footnotes and look at some works with which the book is in conversation. This does not mean reading multiple additional books; it does mean learning how to get a sense of what a book or article is about without reading the whole thing (hint: reading reviews helps a lot).

**3. Final Project :** Each student will write an end-of-term essay of 2000-2500 words (not including notes), to be submitted to Canvas by the end of the day on **May 11**. This project may take one of several forms:

A: Draw together the readings from several weeks of the syllabus, identifying an important theme or approach running through these works in order to challenge or revise an existing consensus or approach, or doing some other, comparably significant intellectual work. **Note that the listed "Supplemental" readings for each week may be useful for this and other final projects.**

B: Identify a topic in the history of citizenship and belonging in the U.S. that is not covered (or not adequately covered) on this syllabus and make an argument about how considering that topic would transform our understanding of the course's questions and themes.

C: Outline a research project in this field, focusing on how it is informed by the existing scholarship and how it could transform that scholarship.

D: Evaluate a classic overview of U.S. citizenship – e.g., Rogers Smith, *Civic Ideals* or James Kettner, *Development of American Citizenship* – in light of the historiography presented here, showing how the work could be reframed or reimagined to deal with more recent historiographical developments.

### Schedule of Course Meetings and Reading Assignments

- Jan. 23      **What is citizenship and how do scholars discuss it?**
- [Linda Bosniak, “Varieties of Citizenship”](#)
  - [Jennifer Gordon and R. A. Lenhardt, “Citizenship Talk: Bridging the Gap between Immigration and Race Perspectives”](#)
  - [K. Tsianina Lomawaima, “The Mutuality of Citizenship and Sovereignty”](#)
  - [Lauren Berlant, “Citizenship”](#)
- Jan. 30      **Slavery and the Conditions of Belonging**
- Walter Johnson, *Soul by Soul: Life inside the Antebellum Slave Market* [ebook](#)
- [Vincent Brown, “Social Death and Political Life in the Study of Slavery”](#)
  - [Walter Johnson, “On Agency”](#)
- Supplemental:
- Steven Hahn, *A Nation under our Feet: Black Political Struggles in the Rural South from Slavery to the Great Migration*
- Stephanie Camp, *Closer to Freedom: Enslaved Women and Everyday Resistance in the Plantation South*
- Manisha Sinha, *The Slave’s Cause: A History of Abolition*
- Feb. 6      **Birthright Citizenship and Racial Difference**
- Martha S. Jones, *Birthright Citizens: A History of Race and Rights in Antebellum America*
- Bethany Berger, [“Birthright Citizenship on Trial: Elk v. Wilkins and United States v. Wong Kim Ark”](#)
- Supplemental:
- Stephen Kantrowitz, *More Than Freedom: Fighting for Black Citizenship in a White Republic, 1829-1889*
- Christian Samito, *Becoming American Under Fire: Irish Americans, African Americans, and the Politics of Citizenship during the Civil War*
- Feb. 13      **Citizenship in the Wartime Crisis of Slavery**
- Stephanie McCurry, *Confederate Reckoning: Power and Politics in the Civil War South* [ebook](#)
- [Amy Dru Stanley, “Instead of Waiting for the Thirteenth Amendment: The War Power, Slave Marriage, and Inviolable Human Rights”](#)
- Supplemental:
- Thavolia Glymph, *The Women’s Fight: The Civil War’s Battles for Home, Freedom, and Nation*
- Erik Mathisen, *The Loyal Republic: Traitors, Slaves, and the Remaking of Citizenship in Civil War America*
- Feb. 20      **Citizenship Remade**
- Eric Foner, *Second Founding: How the Civil War and Reconstruction Remade the Constitution*

- [Stephen Kantrowitz, “White Supremacy, Settler Colonialism, and the Two Citizenships of the Fourteenth Amendment” \(uncorrected proof\)](#)
- Claudio Saunt, “The Paradox of Freedom: Tribal Sovereignty and Emancipation in the Reconstruction of Indian Territory,” *Journal of Southern History* (2004)

Supplemental:

Eric Foner, *Reconstruction: America’s Unfinished Revolution, 1863-1877*  
Faye Dudden, *Fighting Chance: The Struggle over Woman Suffrage and Black Suffrage in Reconstruction America*  
Pamela Brandwein, *Rethinking the Judicial Settlement of Reconstruction*

Feb. 27

**Borders of Liberal Citizenship**

Amy Dru Stanley, *From Bondage to Contract: Wage Labor, Marriage, and the Market in the Age of Slave Emancipation* [ebook](#)

- [Uday S. Mehta, “Liberal Strategies of Exclusion”](#)
- Evelyn Atkinson, “Slaves, Coolies, and Shareholders: Corporations Claim the Fourteenth Amendment,” *Journal of the Civil War Era* 10 (March 2020), 54-80 (if available in time)

Supplemental:

Barbara Welke, *Law and the Borders of Belonging*  
Kate Masur, *An Example for All the Land: Emancipation and the Struggle over Equality in Washington, D.C.*  
Gregory P. Downs, *Declarations of Dependence: The Long Reconstruction of Popular Politics in the South, 1861-1908*

Mar. 5

**Native Belonging against and amid the United States, 1**

Nick Estes, *Our History is the Future: Standing Rock versus the Dakota Access Pipeline, and the Long Tradition of Indigenous Resistance*

- [Pekka Hämmäläinen, “Reconstructing the Great Plains: The Long Struggle for Sovereignty and Dominance in the Heart of the Continent”](#)

Supplemental:

Louis Warren, *God’s Red Son: The Ghost Dance Religion and the Making of Modern America*  
Frederick Hoxie, *Parading through History: The Crow Nation in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century*  
Michael Witgen, *Seeing Red: Indigenous Land, Black Lives, and the Political Economy of Plunder in North America* (forthcoming)

Mar. 12

**Settler Colonialism and Incorporation**

Christina Snyder, *Great Crossings: Indians, Settlers, and Slaves in the Age of Jackson*

- [Patrick Wolfe, “Land, Labor, and Difference: Elementary Structures of Race”](#)

Supplemental:

Lisa Ford, *Settler Sovereignty: Jurisdiction and Indigenous People in America and Australia, 1788-1836*  
John Bowes, *Exiles and Pioneers: Eastern Indians in the Trans-Mississippi West*  
Walter Johnson, *The Broken Heart of America: St. Louis and the Violent History of the United States*

Mar. 26

**Native Belonging against and amid the United States, 2**

Maurice Crandall, *The People Have Always Been a Republic: Indigenous Electorates in the U.S.-Mexico Borderlands, 1598-1912* (skim chs. 1-2)

- [Michael Witgen, “Seeing Red: Race, Citizenship, and Indigeneity in the Old Northwest”](#)
- [Jameson Sweet, “Native Suffrage: Race, Citizenship, and Dakota Indians in the Upper Midwest”](#)

Supplemental:

Deborah Rosen, *American Indians and State Law: Sovereignty, Race, and Citizenship, 1790-1880*

Sidney L. Harring, *Crow Dog's Case: American Indian Sovereignty, Tribal Law, and United States Law in the Nineteenth Century*

Cathleen Cahill, *Federal Mothers and Fathers: A Social History of the Indian Service, 1869-1933*

Apr. 2 **Post-emancipation Citizenship and Settler Colonialism**

Kendra Field, *Growing up with the Country: Family, Race, and Nation after the Civil War*

- [Tiya Miles, "Beyond a Boundary: Black Lives and the Settler-Native Divide"](#)

Supplemental:

Celia Naylor, *African Cherokees in Indian Territory: From Chattel to Citizens*

David Chang, *The Color of the Land: Race, Nation, and the Politics of Landownership in Oklahoma, 1832-1929*

Nell Irvin Painter, *Exodusters: Black Migration to Kansas after Reconstruction*

Apr. 9 **The Conditions of Women's Citizenship**

Linda Kerber, *No Constitutional Right to be Ladies: Women and the Obligations of Citizenship*

- [Nancy Cott, "Marriage and Women's Citizenship in the United States, 1830-1934"](#)

Supplemental:

April Haynes, *Riotous Flesh: Women, Physiology, and the Solitary Vice in Nineteenth-Century America*

Martha Jones, *All Bound up Together: The Woman Question in African American Public Culture, 1830-1900*

Nell Irvin Painter, *Sojourner Truth: A Life, A Symbol*

Apr. 16 **Alien Citizens**

Beth Lew-Williams, *The Chinese Must Go: Violence, Exclusion, and the Making of the Alien in America* [ebook](#)

- [Stacey L. Smith, "Emancipating Peons, Excluding Coolies: Reconstructing Coercion in the American West"](#)

Supplemental:

Mae Ngai, *Impossible Subjects: Illegal Aliens and the Making of Modern America*

Katherine Benton-Cohen, *Inventing the Immigration Problem: The Dillingham Commission and its Legacy*

Hidetaka Hirota, *Expelling the Poor: Atlantic Seaboard States and the Nineteenth-century Origins of American Immigration Policy*

Apr. 23 **Article workshop**

Apr. 30 **Citizenship, Empire, and Subordination**

Sam Erman, *Almost Citizens: Puerto Rico, the U.S. Constitution, and Empire* [partial ebook](#)

- Rebecca Scott, "Public Rights, Social Equality, and the Conceptual Roots of the *Plessy* Challenge"

Supplemental:

Paul Kramer, *The Blood of Government: Race, Empire, the United States, and the Philippines*

Stephen Kantrowitz, *Ben Tillman and the Reconstruction of White Supremacy*