

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN-MADISON
Department of History
Semester I, 2006-2007
Fall 2006
History 982- Native-State Relations in Latin America

Florencia E. Mallon
5125 Humanities
263-1822; femallon@wisc.edu

Office Hours:
Mondays, 12:00-1:00 (Walk-In Hours)
Wednesdays, 1:30-3:30 (Appointments; Sign Up on the Sheet Outside My Door)
And By Appointment

Course Description:

Since the beginning of the 1970s, and according to distinct calendars and internal logics, native peoples throughout Latin America have been engaging in new kinds of social movements that make claims on governments and states based on revived indigenous identities. Why have these movements emerged over the past 30-40 years? How have previous histories of native-state relations affected the form taken by, and success of, these movements?

In addition to studying the various cases of indigenous identity movements in the context of native-state relations, we will also consider them in relationship to other social movements that have privileged other identities. What has historically been the nature of interactions between indigenous people and other mobilizations, such as class-based movements or oppositional political parties? What do these interactions have to tell us about the achievements and limitations of “national-popular” coalitions? Is there something about the contemporary world that has encouraged the multiplication and internationalization of indigenous movements? Are there deep differences hidden among these apparent similarities?

Ultimately, the purpose of our seminar is both historical and historiographical. We wish to trace the changes going on in 20th and 21st century Latin American politics by focusing on indigenous movements. But we also want to explore the ways in which the emergence of indigenous movements has begun to change the nature of historiography. Are we seeing new things in 20th century history because of present-day sensitivity to indigeneity? How do these new perspectives provide us with new tools with which to revise our analyses of other topics, such as state formation, nationalism, or the agrarian question?

Course Requirements:

1) *Class participation.* This is a reading and discussion course, and therefore participation is a key part of how students will be evaluated. I will evaluate participation on two different levels:

a) “Traditional” participation in the seminar discussions. Taking the time and energy to contribute to class discussion, whether with a comment, question, doubt or criticism, is a crucial component of this. Active participation does not always mean speaking a lot, but it does mean listening to and engaging with other people’s ideas and comments, and being willing to risk asking a “stupid” question in order to move the discussion forward. It also means making a special effort to evaluate the readings in relation to the class’s broader questions and concerns, both as they are stated in the syllabus and as they

emerge from our accumulated discussions.

b) Participation on our email classlist. I will use our electronic classlist to send out questions for discussion ahead of our meetings, but I will also expect everyone to email to the list a 1-2-page reaction paper on the week's readings by noon on the Monday before class so that we can all come prepared with an idea of what reactions the readings have elicited. *(Each student will be expected to email reactions to the list 12 out of 14 weeks, the other two being "rest weeks" that should be planned according to the rest of your schedule. Please let me know the week before if you don't plan to send a reaction paper to the list).* In addition to preparing thoughtful, cogent, and stimulating reaction papers, students are encouraged to deepen the course's electronic community by sharing reactions to the readings—or to related news stories or web page resources—at other times during the semester.

2) *Writing Assignment for the Class:* You may choose between two options, depending on the nature of your own work and its relationship to the class.

a) If you are just starting out or just beginning to explore an interest in indigenous issues or Native-state relations, you may want to choose this option, which consists of two literature reviews or historiography essays, 10 pp. each, which start from a week's discussion topic and explore an expanded bibliography on that topic of about 3-5 books and an equal number of articles (combinations will depend on the specific topic and existing literature). People choosing this option should spread their papers out by choosing one from each of two units in the class.

b) If you are already working on a topic related to indigenous issues or Native-state relations, you may write a longer paper based on your research that incorporates materials from the course into its larger framework. This paper, approximately, 20 pp. in length, will be due at the end of the semester. Its main purpose, from the perspective of the class, will be to incorporate what you have learned, conceptually and historiographically, into the overall framing of your research.

Although people wishing to write literature reviews or historiography essays on topics in the first few weeks of the semester will need to do so earlier, I expect that everyone in the class will have met with me to announce their choice of writing assignments, and begin a discussion of relevant sources for those assignments, NO LATER THAN THE THIRD WEEK OF THE SEMESTER.

3) Grading: Participation: 50%
Research Essay: 50% (If two literature reviews or historiography essays, 25% each)

LIST OF BOOKS AVAILABLE FOR PURCHASE

(In Alphabetical Order)

1) Bonfil Batalla, Guillermo, México Profundo: Reclaiming a Civilization, trans. Philip A. Dennis (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1996).

- 2) de la Cadena, Marisol, Indigenous Mestizos: The Politics of Race and Culture in Cuzco, Peru, 1919-1991 (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000).
- 3) Díaz Polanco, Héctor, Indigenous Peoples in Latin America : The Quest for Self-Determination, trans. Lucía Rayas (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997).
- 4) Hale, Charles R., Resistance and Contradiction: Miskitu Indians and the Nicaraguan State, 1894-1987 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1994).
- 5) Lewis, Stephen E., The Ambivalent Revolution : Forging State and Nation in Chiapas, 1910-1945 (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005).
- 6) Mallon, Florencia E., Courage Tastes of Blood: The Mapuche Community of Nicolás Ailío and the Chilean State, 1906-2001 (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2005).
- 7) Postero, Nancy Grey and Leon Zamosc (eds.), The Struggle for Indigenous Rights in Latin America (Portland, OR: Sussex Academic Press, 2004).
- 8) Rappaport, Joanne, Intercultural Utopias: Public Intellectuals, Cultural Experimentation, and Ethnic Pluralism in Colombia (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2005).
- 9) Rappaport, Joanne, The Politics of Memory: Native Historical Interpretation in the Colombian Andes, 2nd. Ed. (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1998).
- 10) Rus, Jan, Rosalva Aída Hernández Castillo, and Shannan L. Mattiace (eds.), Mayan Lives, Mayan Utopias: The Indigenous Peoples of Chiapas and the Zapatista Rebellion (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2003).
- 11) Sieder, Rachel, (ed.), Multiculturalism in Latin America : Indigenous Rights, Diversity, and Democracy (New York : Palgrave Macmillan, 2002).
- 12) Warren, Kay B., Indigenous Movements and their Critics: Pan-Maya Activism in Guatemala (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1998).

PLEASE NOTE: Assigned books are available for purchase at Rainbow Bookstore Cooperative, 426 W. Gilman, 257-6050, and on three-hour reserve at the College Library in Helen C. White. Articles designated with an * are in a xerox packet available in the Humanities Copy Center, 1650 Humanities, and a copy is also on three-hour reserve at the College Library in Helen C. White.

SCHEDULE OF MEETINGS, READINGS, AND ASSIGNMENTS

Tuesday, 5 September- Introduction and Organizational Meeting

UNIT I- Indigenous Identities, Autonomy and Self-Determination: Some Initial Approaches

Tuesday, 12 September- National Minorities, Self-Determination and Indigenous Rights

Reading: Héctor Díaz Polanco, Indigenous Peoples in Latin America : The Quest for

Self-Determination, trans. Lucía Rayas (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997).

Gustavo Esteva, "The Meaning and Scope of the Struggle for Autonomy," in Jan Rus, Rosalva Aída Hernández Castillo, and Shannan L. Mattiace (eds.), Mayan Lives, Mayan Utopias: The Indigenous Peoples of Chiapas and the Zapatista Rebellion (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 2003), pp. 243-69.

Tuesday, 19 September- Mestizaje, Modernism and Civilization Invisibility and Integration

Reading: Guillermo Bonfil Batalla, México Profundo: Reclaiming a Civilization, trans. Philip A. Dennis (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1996).

*Claudio Lomnitz, "Bordering on Anthropology: Dialectics of a National Tradition," in Lomnitz, Deep Mexico, Silent Mexico: An Anthropology of Nationalism (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2001), pp. 228-62.

Tuesday, 26 September- Multiculturalism and Indigenous Rights (I)

Reading: Nancy Grey Postero and Leon Zamosc, "Indigenous Movements and the Indian Question in Latin America (Introduction)," in Postero and Zamosc (eds), The Struggle for Indigenous Rights in Latin America (Portland, OR: Sussex Academic Press, 2004), Ch. 1.

Rachel Sieder, "Introduction," in Sieder (ed.), Multiculturalism in Latin America : Indigenous Rights, Diversity, and Democracy (New York : Palgrave Macmillan, 2002), pp. 1-23.

Rodolfo Stavenhagen, " Indigenous Peoples and the State in Latin America: An Ongoing Debate," in Sieder (ed.), pp. 24-44.

Donna Lee Van Cott, "Constitutional Reform in the Andes: Redefining Indigenous-State Relations," in Sieder (ed.), pp. 45-73.

Rachel Sieder, "Recognising Indigenous Law and the Politics of State Formation in Mesoamerica," in Sieder (ed.), pp. 184-207.

Roger Plant, "Latin America's Multiculturalism: Economic and Agrarian Dimensions," in Sieder (ed.), pp. 208-226.

Shelton H. Davis, "Indigenous Peoples, Poverty and Participatory Development: The Experience of the World Bank in Latin America," in Sieder (ed.), pp. 227-51.

Tuesday, 3 October- Multiculturalism and Indigenous Rights (II): Mexico and the Andes Compared (**Need to Reschedule**)

Reading: Xavier Albó, "From Indian and Campesino Leaders to Councillors and Parliamentary Deputies," in Sieder, pp. 74-102.

Gunther Dietz, "From Indigenismo to Zapatismo: The Struggle for a Multi-Ethnic

Mexican Society,” in Postero and Zamosc (eds.), Ch. 2.

Guillermo de la Peña, “Social Citizenship, Ethnic Minority Demands, Human Rights and Neoliberal Paradoxes: A Case Study in Western Mexico,” in Sieder, pp. 129-156.

Raquel Yrigoyen Fajardo, “Peru: Pluralist Constitution, Monist Judiciary–A Post-Reform Assessment,” in Sieder, pp. 157-83.

Leon Zamosc, “The Indian Movement in Ecuador: From Politics of Influence to Politics of Power,” in Postero and Zamosc (eds.), Ch. 5.

UNIT II- Native-State Relations: A Historical View

Tuesday, 10 October- The Deep History of Indigenous Revitalization: Bolivia

Reading: * Sinclair Thomson, We Alone Will Rule: Native Andean Politics in the Age of Insurgency (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2002), pp. 140-231, 269-80, 322-40, 348-50.

* Brooke Larson, Trials of Nation Making: Liberalism, Race, and Ethnicity in the Andes, 1810-1910 (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 202-45.

* Seemin Qayum, “Nationalism, Internal Colonialism, and the Spatial Imagination: The Geographic Society of La Paz in Turn-of-the-Century Bolivia,” in James Dunkerley (ed.), Studies in the Formation of the Nation State in Latin America (University of London: Institute of Latin American Studies, 2002), pp. 275-98.

* Xavier Albó, “From MNRistas to Kataristas to Katari,” in Steve J. Stern (ed.), Resistance, Rebellion and Consciousness in the Andean Peasant World, 18th to 20th Centuries (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), pp. 379-419.

* Silvia Rivera Cusicanqui, “Oppressed but not Defeated”: Peasant Struggles Among the Aymara and Qhechwa in Bolivia, 1900-1980 (Geneva: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, 1987; Or. Sp. Ed., 1984), pp. 135-56.

* Silvia Rivera Cusicanqui, “Liberal Democracy and *Ayllu* Democracy in Bolivia: The Case of Northern Potosí,” The Journal of Development Studies, 26:4 (July 1990), pp. 97-121.

Tuesday, 17 October- Alternative Histories and Memories: Colombia

Reading: Joanne Rappaport, The Politics of Memory: Native Historical Interpretation in the Colombian Andes, 2nd. Ed. (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1998).

Tuesday, 24 October- Alternative Nationalisms and Indigenous Identities

Reading: Greg Grandin, The Blood of Guatemala: A History of Race and Nation (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000).

Edward Fischer, "Beyond Victimization: Maya Movements in Post-War Guatemala," in Postero and Zamosc (eds.), Ch. 3.

Tuesday, 31 October- Postrevolutionary Politics and Indigenous Peoples: Mexico

Reading: Stephen E. Lewis, The Ambivalent Revolution : Forging State and Nation in Chiapas, 1910-1945 (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2005).

*Alexander Dawson, "'Wild Indians', 'Mexican Gentlemen,' and the Lessons Learned in the Casa del Estudiante Indígena, 1926-1932," The Americas, 57:3 (Jan 2001), pp. 329-361.

*Alexander Dawson, "From Models for the Nation to Model Citizens: "Indigenismo" and the "Revindication" of the Mexican Indian, 1920-40," Journal of Latin American Studies, 30:2 (May 1998), pp. 279-308.

* Jan Rus, "The 'Comunidad Revolucionaria Institucional': The Subversion of Native Government in Highland Chiapas, 1936-1968," in Gilbert Joseph and Daniel Nugent (eds.), Everyday Forms of State Formation: Revolution and the Negotiation of Rule in Modern Mexico (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1994), pp. 265-300.

Tuesday, 7 November-Indigenous Views of History

Reading: Florencia E. Mallon, Courage Tastes of Blood: The Mapuche Community of Nicolás Ailío and the Chilean State, 1906-2001 (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2005).

* Stephen E. Lewis, "Myth and the History of Chile's Araucanians," Radical History Review, 58 (1994), pp. 112-141.

UNIT III- Ethnic Revitalization and Indigenous Militancy

Tuesday, 14 November- The Opposite of Strength in Numbers? Colombia

Reading: Joanne Rappaport, Intercultural Utopias: Public Intellectuals, Cultural Experimentation, and Ethnic Pluralism in Colombia (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2005).

Theodor Rathgeber, "Indigenous Struggles in Colombia: Historical Changes and Perspectives," in Postero and Zamosc (eds.), Ch. 4.

Tuesday, 21 November- Strategic Peripheries (I): The Atlantic Coast of Nicaragua

Reading: Charles R. Hale, Resistance and Contradiction: Miskitu Indians and the Nicaraguan State, 1894-1987 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1994).

* Jeffrey L. Gould, "'¡Vana Ilusión!' The Highlands Indians and the Myth of Nicaragua

History 982-Native-State Relations in Latin America-Mallon--Fall 2006--page 7

Mestiza, 1880-1925," Hispanic American Historical Review, 73:3 (August 1993), pp. 393-429.

Tuesday, 28 November- Strategic Peripheries (II): Chiapas

Reading : Rus, Hernández Castillo, and Mattiace (eds.), Mayan Lives, pp. 1-241.

Tuesday, 5 December- The Majority Finds Its Voice? (I): Bolivia vs. Peru

Reading: Marisol de la Cadena, Indigenous Mestizos: The Politics of Race and Culture in Cuzco, Peru, 1919-1991 (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000).

Nancy Postero, "Articulations and Fragmentations: Indigenous Politics in Bolivia," in Postero and Zamosc (eds.), Ch. 7.

María Elena García and José Antonio Lucero, "Un País Sin Indígenas"?: Re-thinking Indigenous Politics in Peru," in Postero and Zamosc (eds.), Ch. 6.

Tuesday, 12 December- The Majority Finds Its Voice? (II): Guatemala

Reading: Kay B. Warren, Indigenous Movements and their Critics: Pan-Maya Activism in Guatemala (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1998).

Demetrio Cojttí Cuxil, "Educational Reform in Guatemala: Lessons from Negotiations Between Indigenous Civil Society and the State," in Sieder, pp. 103-28.

* Charles R. Hale, "Does Multiculturalism Menace?: Governance, Cultural Rights, and the Politics of Identity in Guatemala," Journal of Latin American Studies, 34:3 (August 2002), pp. 485-524.

LIST OF ARTICLES, XEROX PACKET

(In the Order Assigned)

- 1) Claudio Lomnitz, "Bordering on Anthropology: Dialectics of a National Tradition," in Lomnitz, Deep Mexico, Silent Mexico: An Anthropology of Nationalism (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2001), pp. 228-62.
- 2) Sinclair Thomson, We Alone Will Rule: Native Andean Politics in the Age of Insurgency (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2002), pp. 140-231, 269-80, 322-40, 348-50.
- 3) Brooke Larson, Trials of Nation Making: Liberalism, Race, and Ethnicity in the Andes, 1810-1910 (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 202-45.
- 4) Seemin Qayum, "Nationalism, Internal Colonialism, and the Spatial Imagination: The Geographic Society of La Paz in Turn-of-the-Century Bolivia," in James Dunkerley (ed.), Studies in the Formation of the Nation State in Latin America (University of London: Institute of Latin American Studies, 2002), pp. 275-98.
- 5) Xavier Albó, "From MNRistas to Kataristas to Katari," in Steve J. Stern (ed.), Resistance, Rebellion and Consciousness in the Andean Peasant World, 18th to 20th Centuries (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), pp. 379-419.
- 6) Silvia Rivera Cusicanqui, "Oppressed but not Defeated": Peasant Struggles Among the Aymara and Qhechwa in Bolivia, 1900-1980 (Geneva: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, 1987; Or. Sp. Ed., 1984), pp. 135-56.
- 7) Silvia Rivera Cusicanqui, "Liberal Democracy and *Ayllu* Democracy in Bolivia: The Case of Northern Potosí," The Journal of Development Studies, 26:4 (July 1990), pp. 97-121.
- 8) Alexander Dawson, "'Wild Indians', 'Mexican Gentlemen,' and the Lessons Learned in the Casa del Estudiante Indígena, 1926-1932," The Americas, 57:3 (Jan 2001), pp. 329-361.
- 9) Alexander Dawson, "From Models for the Nation to Model Citizens: 'Indigenismo' and the 'Revindication' of the Mexican Indian, 1920-40," Journal of Latin American Studies, 30:2 (May 1998), pp. 279-308.
- 10) Jan Rus, "The 'Comunidad Revolucionaria Institucional': The Subversion of Native Government in Highland Chiapas, 1936-1968," in Gilbert Joseph and Daniel Nugent (eds.), Everyday Forms of State Formation: Revolution and the Negotiation of Rule in Modern Mexico (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1994), pp. 265-300.
- 11) Stephen E. Lewis, "Myth and the History of Chile's Araucanians," Radical History Review, 58 (1994), pp. 112-141.
- 12) Jeffrey L. Gould, "'¡Vana Ilusión!' The Highlands Indians and the Myth of Nicaragua Mestiza, 1880-1925," Hispanic American Historical Review, 73:3 (August 1993), pp. 393-429.
- 13) Charles R. Hale, "Does Multiculturalism Menace?: Governance, Cultural Rights, and the Politics of Identity in Guatemala," Journal of Latin American Studies, 34:3 (August 2002), pp. 485-524.