

UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN
Department of History
Semester II, 2013-2014

History 706- Topics in Transnational History: Nation-States, Empires, & Coloniality in "Our America"

Florencia E. Mallon
5125 Humanities
263-1822; femallon@wisc.edu

Office Hours: Tuesdays and Thursdays, 2-4 pm. or by appointment

Course Description:

A century ago, many Latin American intellectuals still referred to the full western hemisphere as "Our America." But how did "America" become shorthand for the "United States of America" in the United States? The appropriation of a hemispheric geographical term to designate a single country, some historians suggest, was part of an evolving nineteenth-century vision of historical exceptionalism fed by a discourse of the progressive frontier and manifest destiny and became part of a unifying national discourse in the wake of the Civil War, evolving even further with the Spanish-American War.

In Chile, especially after 1884, a parallel discourse of exceptionalism and of Chilean superiority has also marked national historiography. In Argentina by the 1870s, discourses of "civilization and barbarism" pioneered by Domingo Faustino Sarmiento created a sense of uniqueness centered mainly in Buenos Aires and based on education and Europeanness. And in Mexico after the 1910 Revolution, the Mexican nation was seen as an exceptional case because its postrevolutionary state made equality and integration possible for indigenous people, peasants and workers. Placing historical events in 19th and 20th century Chile, the United States, Mexico, and Argentina into a common discussion of colonialism and decolonization that includes indigenous and Afro-Descendant peoples, we will trouble notions of historical exceptionalism throughout the hemisphere.

This kind of broad historical topic, in the context of hemispheric relations of power and changing political debates, is an ideal one through which to explore the multiple meanings of "historiography." Rather than limit our understanding of the term to the evolving nature of interpretations, from less current to more current, we will explore the interactions between historians' approaches to their materials and the historical and political contexts in which they are writing. As part of this discussion, students will write papers exploring the development of a particular historiography concerning a topic or issue of special interest to them.

Class Requirements:

- 1) This class is essentially a reading and discussion class, and as such it is heavily weighted toward class participation. Participation will constitute 50% of the overall grade.
 - a. Taking the time and energy to contribute to class discussion, whether with a comment, question, doubt, or criticism, is **the** crucial component of class participation.

- b. Active participation does not always mean speaking a lot, but it does mean listening to and engaging other people's ideas and comments, and being willing to risk asking a "stupid" question in order to move the discussion forward. It also means regular attendance in class and making every effort to plan ahead so as to not miss our discussions.
 - c. In addition to weekly discussion, I will ask students to post a weekly reaction to the readings on our classlist by 2 p.m. the Monday before Tuesday's class.
 - d. A final part of discussion participation will involve taking an active part in organizing discussion for the week related to the chosen topic of the paper assignment (please see below for more details).
- 2) The other 50% of the grade in the seminar will be composed of a historiographical paper about 15- 20 pp. long. In conversation with me, each of you can tailor the paper to fit your research and regional interests. The last two weeks of the class will be dedicated to the presentation and discussion of your paper drafts.
- a. As we look through the syllabus on the first day, you are encouraged to think about which topic most connects to your work.
 - b. Please meet with me **lastest** by the end of the second week of the semester to begin discussing the process for the paper and to figure out the week for which you will help to organize discussion. **Of course, if you wish to write a paper about the topic of the second or third week, perhaps we need to meet a bit earlier ☺!**

Please Note: The books in the syllabus are available at the University Bookstore. They are also on three-hour reserve at the College Library in Helen C. White.

There is also a xerox packet available at the Humanities Copy Center, 1650 Humanities Bldg., 263-1803; Hours M-F, 7:45-11:45 A.M., 12:30-4:00 P.M. Its contents are listed, in order of assignment, at the end of the syllabus. There is also a copy on reserve at Helen C. White.

UNIT I- Setting the Scene, Defining the Problem

January 21-Introduction and Organizational Meeting

January 28- America: Definitions and Debates (I)

Reading: Jorge Cañizares-Esguerra, *Puritan Conquistadors: Iberianizing the Atlantic, 1550-1700* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2006).

February 4- America: Definitions and Debates (II)

Reading: Jack P. Greene, *The Intellectual Construction of America: Exceptionalism and Identity from 1492 to 1800* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1993, paperback 1997).

February 11- Discourses of Exceptionalism: The United States

Reading:

- ❖ Daniel T. Rodgers, "Exceptionalism," in Anthony Molho and Gordon S. Wood, *Imagined Histories: American Historians Interpret the Past* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1998), pp. 21-40.

Anders Stephanson, *Manifest Destiny: American Expansion and the Empire of Right* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1995).

February 18- Discourses of Exceptionalism: Mexico

Reading: Claudio Lomnitz, *Deep Mexico, Silent Mexico: An Anthropology of Nationalism* (Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press, 2001).

- ❖ Alexander S. Dawson, "From Models for the Nation to Model Citizens: Indigenismo and the 'Revindication' of the Mexican Indian, 1920-40," *Journal of Latin American Studies*, Vol. 30, No. 2 (May, 1998), pp. 279-308.

February 25- Discourses of Exceptionalism: Chile

Reading: Maurice Zeitlin, *The Civil Wars in Chile, Or, the Bourgeois Revolutions That Never Were* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1984; paperback 1988).

March 4- Discourses of Exceptionalism: Argentina

Reading: Nicolas Shumway, *The Invention of Argentina* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1991).

- Ariel de la Fuente, *Children of Facundo: Caudillo and Gaucho Insurgency during the Argentine State-Formation Process (La Rioja, 1853-1870)* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2000).

UNIT II- The United States as America: Historical Constructions

March 11- War as a Way of Life (I)?

Reading: Amy S. Greenberg, *A Wicked War: Polk, Clay, Lincoln, and the 1846 U.S. Invasion of Mexico* (New York: Random House, 2012; Vintage Paperback, 2013).

- ❖ Enrique Krauze, "The Ugly Legacy of the Mexican-American War," *Foreign Affairs*, November/December 2013.
- ❖ John Tutino, "Mexico and Mexicans Making U.S. History," in Tutino (ed.), *Mexico and Mexicans in the Making of the United States* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2012), pp. 1-35.
- ❖ John Tutino, "Capitalist Foundations: Spanish North America, Mexico, and the United States," in Tutino (ed.), *Mexico and Mexicans in the Making of the United States*, pp. 36-82.

****MARCH 15 -23--SPRING BREAK****

March 25- War as a Way of Life (II)?

- ❖ Reading: Amy Kaplan, "Black and Blue on San Juan Hill," in Amy Kaplan and Donald E. Pease (eds.), *Cultures of United States Imperialism* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1993), pp. 219-36.
- ❖ Philip S. Foner, "Introduction," in Foner (ed.), *Inside the Monster by José Martí: Writings on the United States and American Imperialism* (New York and London: Monthly Review Press, 1975), pp. 15-48.
- ❖ José Martí, "Prologue: The Truth About the United States," in Foner (ed.), *Inside the Monster*, pp. 49-54.

- ❖ José Martí, "The Menace of United States Imperialism," in Foner (ed.), *Inside the Monster*, pp. 325-82.
- ❖ "An Historical and True Account of the Cruel Massacre and Slaughter of 20,000,000 of People in the West Indies by the SPANIARDS. Written by Bishop Las Casas, An Eyewitness. Translated from the French Edition, printed in 1620." New York: J.B., 1898.

UNIT III- War and the Construction of National Identity in Latin America

April 1- Cuba and Mexico

Reading: Ada Ferrer, *Insurgent Cuba: Race, Nation, and Revolution, 1868-1898* (Chapel Hill and London: University of North Carolina Press, 1999).

Florencia E. Mallon, *Peasant and Nation: The Making of Postcolonial Mexico and Peru* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1995).

April 8- The War of the Triple Alliance (I): The Paraguayan Context

- ❖ Reading: Richard Alan White, *Paraguay's Autonomous Revolution, 1810-1840* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1978), pp. 1-14, 99-125.
- ❖ F. J. McLynn, "The Causes of the War of Triple Alliance: An Interpretation," *Inter-American Economic Affairs*, 33:2 (Autumn 1979), pp. 21-43.

April 15- The War of the Triple Alliance (II): Argentina, Brazil, and Uruguay

- ❖ Reading: José Alfredo Fornos Peñalba, "Draft Dodgers, War Resisters and Turbulent Gauchos: The War of the Triple Alliance against Paraguay," *The Americas*, 38:4 (April 1982), pp. 463-79.
- ❖ F. J. McLynn, "Consequences for Argentina of the War of the Triple Alliance 1865-1870," *The Americas*, 41:1 (July 1984), pp. 81-98.
- ❖ Norman T. Strauss, "Brazil after the Paraguayan War: Six Years of Conflict, 1870-6," *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 10:1 (May 1978), pp. 21-35.

April 22- The War of the Pacific (Peru and Chile)

- ❖ Reading: Florencia E. Mallon, *The Defense of Community in Peru's Central Highlands: Peasant Struggle and Capitalist Transition, 1860-1940* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983), pp. 80-122.
- ❖ Heraclio Bonilla, "The Indian Peasantry and 'Peru' during the War with Chile," in Steve J. Stern (ed.), *Resistance, Rebellion, and Consciousness in the Andean Peasant World: 18th to 20th Centuries* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), pp. 219-31.
- ❖ Florencia E. Mallon, "Nationalist and Antistate Coalitions in the War of the Pacific: Junín and Cajamarca, 1879-1902," in Stern (ed.), *Resistance, Rebellion, and Consciousness*, pp. 232-79.

April 29- RESEARCH PRESENTATIONS

May 6- RESEARCH PRESENTATIONS

*****PAPERS DUE LATEST BY WEDNESDAY, MAY 14TH AT 5 PM. IN MY MAILBOX, 5027*****

LIST OF READINGS IN THE XEROX PACKET

- ❖ Daniel T. Rodgers, "Exceptionalism," in Anthony Molho and Gordon S. Wood, *Imagined Histories: American Historians Interpret the Past* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1998), pp. 21-40.
- ❖ Alexander S. Dawson, "From Models for the Nation to Model Citizens: Indigenismo and the 'Revindication' of the Mexican Indian, 1920-40," *Journal of Latin American Studies*, Vol. 30, No. 2 (May, 1998), pp. 279-308.
- ❖ Enrique Krauze, "The Ugly Legacy of the Mexican-American War," *Foreign Affairs*, November/December 2013.
- ❖ John Tutino, "Mexico and Mexicans Making U.S. History," in Tutino (ed.), *Mexico and Mexicans in the Making of the United States* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2012), pp. 1-35.
- ❖ John Tutino, "Capitalist Foundations: Spanish North America, Mexico, and the United States," in Tutino (ed.), *Mexico and Mexicans in the Making of the United States*, pp. 36-82.
- ❖ Amy Kaplan, "Black and Blue on San Juan Hill," in Amy Kaplan and Donald E. Pease (eds.), *Cultures of United States Imperialism* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1993), pp. 219-36.
- ❖ Philip S. Foner, "Introduction," in Foner (ed.), *Inside the Monster by José Martí: Writings on the United States and American Imperialism* (New York and London: Monthly Review Press, 1975), pp. 15-48.
- ❖ José Martí, "Prologue: The Truth About the United States," in Foner (ed.), *Inside the Monster*, pp. 49-54.
- ❖ José Martí, "The Menace of United States Imperialism," in Foner (ed.), *Inside the Monster*, pp. 325-82.
- ❖ "An Historical and True Account of the Cruel Massacre and Slaughter of 20,000,000 of People in the West Indies by the SPANIARDS. Written by Bishop Las Casas, An Eyewitness. Translated from the French Edition, printed in 1620." New York: J.B., 1898.
- ❖ Richard Alan White, *Paraguay's Autonomous Revolution, 1810-1840* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1978), pp. 1-14, 99-125.
- ❖ F. J. McLynn, "The Causes of the War of Triple Alliance: An Interpretation," *Inter-American Economic Affairs*, 33:2 (Autumn 1979), pp. 21-43.

- ❖ Reading: José Alfredo Fornos Peñalba, "Draft Dodgers, War Resisters and Turbulent Gauchos: The War of the Triple Alliance against Paraguay," *The Americas*, 38:4 (April 1982), pp. 463-79.
- ❖ F. J. McLynn, "Consequences for Argentina of the War of the Triple Alliance 1865-1870," *The Americas*, 41:1 (July 1984), pp. 81-98.
- ❖ Norman T. Strauss, "Brazil after the Paraguayan War: Six Years of Conflict, 1870-6," *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 10:1 (May 1978), pp. 21-35.

- ❖ Florencia E. Mallon, *The Defense of Community in Peru's Central Highlands: Peasant Struggle and Capitalist Transition, 1860-1940* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1983), pp. 80-122.
- ❖ Heraclio Bonilla, "The Indian Peasantry and 'Peru' during the War with Chile," in Steve J. Stern (ed.), *Resistance, Rebellion, and Consciousness in the Andean Peasant*

World: 18th to 20th Centuries (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), pp. 219-31.

- ❖ Florencia E. Mallon, "Nationalist and Antistate Coalitions in the War of the Pacific: Junín and Cajamarca, 1879-1902," in Stern (ed.), *Resistance, Rebellion, and Consciousness*, pp. 232-79.